Methanotrophy within the water column of a large meromictic tropical lake (Lake Kivu, East Africa)
Morana, C.; Borges, A. V.; Roland, François; Darchambeau, François; Descy, Jean-Pierre; Bouillon, S.

Published in:
Biogeosciences

DOI:
10.5194/bg-12-2077-2015

Publication date:
2015

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link to publication
Citation for published version (HARVARD):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 04. Jan. 2019
Methanotrophy within the water column of a large meromictic tropical lake (Lake Kivu, East Africa)

C. Morana1, A. V. Borges2, F. A. E. Roland2, F. Darchambeau2, J.-P. Descy3, and S. Bouillon1

1Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, KU Leuven, Leuven, Belgium
2Chemical Oceanography Unit, Université de Liège, Liege, Belgium
3Research Unit in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology, UNamur, Namur, Belgium

Correspondence to: C. Morana (cedric.morana@ees.kuleuven.be)

Received: 9 October 2014 – Published in Biogeosciences Discuss.: 7 November 2014
Revised: 23 March 2015 – Accepted: 24 March 2015 – Published: 7 April 2015

Abstract. The permanently stratified Lake Kivu is one of the largest freshwater reservoirs of dissolved methane (CH4) on Earth. Yet CH4 emissions from its surface to the atmosphere have been estimated to be 2 orders of magnitude lower than the CH4 upward flux to the mixed layer, suggesting that microbial CH4 oxidation is an important process within the water column. A combination of natural abundance stable carbon isotope analysis (δ13C) of several carbon pools and 13CH4-labelling experiments was carried out during the rainy and dry season to quantify (i) the contribution of CH4-derived carbon to the biomass, (ii) methanotrophic bacterial production (MBP), and (iii) methanotrophic bacterial growth efficiency (MBGE), defined as the ratio between MBP and gross CH4 oxidation. We also investigated the distribution and the δ13C of specific phospholipid fatty acids (PLFAs), used as biomarkers for aerobic methanotrophs. Maximal MBP rates were measured in the oxycline, suggesting that CH4 oxidation was mainly driven by oxic processes. Moreover, our data revealed that methanotrophic organisms in the water column oxidized most of the upward flux of CH4 and that a significant amount of CH4-derived carbon was incorporated into the microbial biomass in the oxycline. The MBGE was variable (2–50 %) and negatively related to CH4 : O2 molar ratios. Thus, a comparatively smaller fraction of CH4-derived carbon was incorporated into the cellular biomass in deeper waters, at the bottom of the oxycline where oxygen was scarce. The aerobic methanotrophic community was clearly dominated by type I methanotrophs and no evidence was found for an active involvement of type II methanotrophs in CH4 oxidation in Lake Kivu, based on fatty acids analyses. Vertically integrated over the water column, the MBP was equivalent to 16–60 % of the average phytoplankton particulate primary production. This relatively high magnitude of MBP, and the substantial contribution of CH4-derived carbon to the overall biomass in the oxycline, suggest that methanotrophic bacteria could potentially sustain a significant fraction of the pelagic food web in the deep, meromictic Lake Kivu.

1 Introduction

Although the atmospheric methane (CH4) concentration is low compared to carbon dioxide (CO2), CH4 contributes significantly to the anthropogenic radiative forcing (18 %) because of its 25 times higher global warming potential than CO2 (Forster et al., 2007). CH4 has several natural and anthropogenic sources and sinks, whereby natural and artificial wetlands are recognized as major CH4 sources to the atmosphere (e.g. Kirschke et al., 2013). Bastviken et al. (2011) estimated that CH4 emissions into the atmosphere from freshwater ecosystems (0.65 Pg C yr⁻¹ as CO2 equivalent) would correspond to 25 % of the global land carbon (C) sink (2.6 ± 1.7 Pg C yr⁻¹, Denman et al., 2007). Tropical regions are responsible for approximately half of the estimated CH4 emissions from freshwater ecosystems to the atmosphere, although they have been consistently undersampled (Bastviken et al., 2011). Thus, more information on both the magnitude and controlling factors of CH4 emissions from tropical inland waters is warranted. CH4 production rates are typically higher than CH4 emission fluxes to the atmosphere, since aerobic and anaerobic microbial CH4 oxidation...
within lacustrine sediments or in water columns are effective processes that limit the amount of CH₄ reaching the atmosphere, in particular when vertical CH₄ transport occurs mainly through diffusive transport rather than through ebullition. A wide variety of electron acceptors can be used during microbial CH₄ oxidation, including but not limited to oxygen (O₂, Rudd et al., 1974). The use of an enzyme known as CH₄ monoxygenase to catalyze the oxidation of CH₄ to methanol is a defining characteristic of aerobic methanotrophs (Hanson and Hanson, 1996). Methanol is then oxidized to formaldehyde, which is assimilated to form intermediates of central metabolic routes that are subsequently used for biosynthesis of cell material (Hanson and Hanson, 1996 and references therein). Hence, aerobic methanotrophs use CH₄ not only as an energy source, but also as a C source. Aerobic methanotrophs are typically classified into two phylogenetically distinct groups that use different pathways for the formaldehyde assimilation: the type I methanotrophs belong to the Gammaproteobacteria and use the ribulose monophosphate pathway, while the type II methanotrophs belong to the Alphaproteobacteria and use the serine pathway.

Besides aerobic processes, anaerobic CH₄ oxidation coupled with SO₄²⁻ reduction has been found to be carried out by a syntrophic consortium of CH₄-oxidizing archaea and sulphate-reducing bacteria. The association between the archaea and bacteria is commonly interpreted as an obligate syntrophic interaction in which the archaeal member metabolizes CH₄ leading to the production of an intermediate, which in turn is scavenged as an electron donor by its SO₄²⁻ reducing partner (Knitell and Boetius, 2009), but the identity of the intermediates transferred between the CH₄ oxidizers and the SO₄²⁻ reducers is still uncertain. In contrast to aerobic CH₄ oxidation, the contribution of CH₄ as a C source would be minimal as only ~ 1 % of the oxidized CH₄ is channelled to biosynthesis pathway, and the growth of the partners of the consortium is slow, with generation times of months to years (Knitell and Boetius, 2009). Both partners of the consortium are strictly intolerant to O₂ (Knitell and Boetius, 2009). Initially reported in marine sediments (Boetius et al., 2000), this consortium was later identified in the water column of marine euxinic basins, such as the Black Sea (Schubert et al., 2006), but rarely in lacustrine systems probably because fresh waters are usually depleted in SO₄²⁻ in comparison with other electron acceptors (NO₃⁻, Fe³⁺, Mn⁴⁺) in contrast with the oceans. Nevertheless, it appeared during the last decade that anaerobic CH₄ oxidation could be coupled to a wider variety of electron acceptors that previously thought, including nitrite (NO₂⁻), nitrate (NO₃⁻), manganese (Mn), and iron (Fe) (Raghoebarsing et al., 2006; Beal et al., 2009).

Aerobic methanotrophic organisms not only use CH₄ as electron donors, but they are also able to incorporate a substantial fraction of the CH₄-derived C into their biomass, and could therefore contribute to fuel the pelagic food web (Bastviken et al., 2003; Jones and Grey, 2011; Sanseverino et al., 2012). A recent study carried out in small boreal lakes (surface area < 0.01 km²) demonstrated that methanotrophic bacterial production (MBP, i.e. incorporation rates of CH₄-derived carbon into the biomass) contributed to 13–52 % of the autochtonous primary production in the water column (Kankaala et al., 2013). However, in spite of the potential importance of this alternative C source in aquatic ecosystems, most of the studies carried out in aquatic environments reported gross CH₄ oxidation, while direct measurements of MBP in lakes are still scarce. Also, the methanotrophic bacterial growth efficiency (MBGE), defined as the amount of biomass synthesized from CH₄ per unit of CH₄ oxidized, was found to vary widely in aquatic environments (15–80 % according to King, 1992; 6–77 % according to Bastviken et al., 2003), but little is known about the factors driving its variability so that it is currently not possible to derive accurate estimations of the MBP based solely on gross CH₄ oxidation rates. A better understanding of the environmental control of MBGE would help to assess more accurately the importance of methanotrophic organisms as carbon sources for higher trophic level of the food web.

Lake Kivu, located in a volcanic area, is one of the largest freshwater CH₄ reservoirs, with approximately 60 km² (at standard temperature and pressure) dissolved in its permanently stratified water (Schmid et al., 2005). Although the deep layers of the lake contain a huge amount of dissolved CH₄, Lake Kivu ranks globally among the lakes with the lowest CH₄ emissions into the atmosphere (Borges et al., 2011). Moreover, the emission of CH₄ from surface waters to the atmosphere (0.038 mmol m⁻² d⁻¹, Borges et al., 2011) is several orders of magnitude lower than the upward flux of CH₄ to the mixed layer (9.38 mmol m⁻² d⁻¹, Pasche et al., 2009), suggesting that CH₄ oxidation prevents most of CH₄ to reach the surface of the lake. Our knowledge on bacterial CH₄ oxidation in Lake Kivu has so far been based on circumstantial evidence such as mass balance considerations (Borges et al., 2011; Pasche et al., 2011), identification of aerobic CH₄ oxidizers using molecular tools (Pasche et al., 2011) and lipid analysis (Zigah et al., 2015), and a few incubations carried out almost 40 years ago (Jannasch, 1975).

In this study, we used the difference in C stable isotope abundance (δ¹³C) of different C sources to estimate the fraction of CH₄ inputs to the mixed layer from deep waters that is microbially oxidized within the water column, and to quantify the relative contribution of CH₄-derived C to the particulate biomass. Additionally, phospholipid fatty acids (PLFAs) and their δ¹³C signatures were analyzed to characterize the populations of methanotrophic bacteria present in the water column. We also carried out ¹³CH₄-labelling experiments to trace the incorporation of CH₄-derived C into the biomass (to quantify methanotrophic bacterial production) and its conversion to CO₂ (to quantify methanotrophic bacterial growth efficiency). Finally, stable isotope probing (SIP) of specific PLFAs (SIP-PLFAs) after ¹³C-CH₄
labelling allowed to characterize the bacterial populations active in methanotrophy.

2 Material and methods

2.1 Study site description and sampling

Lake Kivu (East Africa) is a large (2370 km²) and deep (maximum depth of 485 m) meromictic lake. Its vertical structure consists of an oxic and nutrient-poor mixed layer (seasonally variable depth, up to 70 m), and a permanently anoxic monimolimnion rich in dissolved gases (CH₄, CO₂) and inorganic nutrients (Damas, 1937; Degens et al., 1973; Schmid et al., 2005). Seasonal variations of the vertical position of the oxycline are driven by contrasting hygrometry and long wave radiation between rainy (October–May) and dry (June–September) seasons (Thiery et al., 2014), the latter being characterized by a deepening of the oxic zone, and an increased input of dissolved gases and inorganic nutrients into the mixed layer (Sarmento et al., 2006; Borges et al., 2011). Sampling was carried out in the northern basin (1.72° S, 29.23° E) in February 2012 (rainy season), and in the northern basin and southern basin (2.34° S, 28.98° E) in September 2012 (dry season, Fig. 1).

O₂ concentration was measured with a YSI-proODO probe with a optical O₂ sensor (detection limit is 3 μmol L⁻¹), calibrated using air saturated water. Hereafter, “O₂-depleted waters” stands for waters with concentration < 3 μmol L⁻¹. Lake water was collected with a 7 L Niskin bottle (Hydro-Bios) at a depth interval of 5 m from the lake surface to the top of the monimolimnion, at 80 m.

Figure 1. Map of Lake Kivu.

2.2 Chemical analyses

Samples for CH₄ concentrations were collected in 50 mL glass serum bottles from the Niskin bottle with a silicone tubing, left to overflow, poisoned with 100 μL of saturated HgCl₂ and sealed with butyl stoppers and aluminium caps. Concentrations of CH₄ were measured by headspace technique (Weiss, 1981) using gas chromatography with flame ionization detection (GC-FID, SRI 8610C), after creating a 20 mL headspace with N₂ in the glass serum bottles. The GC-FID was calibrated with CH₄:CO₂:N₂:O₂ mixtures (Air Liquide Belgium) of 1.05 ± 0.02, 10.2 ± 0.2, 30.3 ± 0.6 and 509 ± 10 ppm CH₄. Precision estimated from multiple injection of gas standards was better than ±3 % for the 1.05 ppm standard and better than ±0.5 % for the other three standards. The precision estimated from duplicated samples was ±3.9 %. The concentrations were computed using the CH₄ solubility coefficient given by Yamamoto et al. (1976). Samples for the determination of the δ¹³C signature of CH₄ (δ¹³C-CH₄) were collected in 250 mL glass serum bottles similarly to CH₄ concentration samples. δ¹³C-CH₄ was determined by a custom developed technique, whereby a 20 mL helium headspace was first created, and CH₄ was flushed out through a double-hole needle, CO₂ was removed with a CO₂ trap (soda lime), and the CH₄ was converted to CO₂ in an online combustion column similar to that in an elemental analyzer (EA). The resulting CO₂ was subsequently preconcentrated by the immersion of a stainless steel loop in liquid nitrogen in a custom-built cryo-focussing device, passed through a micro-packed GC column (HayeSep Q 2 m, 0.75 mm ID; Restek), and finally measured on a Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage isotope ratio mass spectrometer (IRMS). Certified reference standards for δ¹³C analysis (IAEA-CO1 and LSVEC) were used to calibrate δ¹³C-CH₄ data. Reproducibility of measurement estimated based on duplicate injection of a selection of samples was typically better than ±0.5 ‰, or better than ±0.2 ‰ when estimated based on multiple injection of standard gas.

Samples for the determination of δ¹³C signatures of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) were collected by gently overfilling 12 mL glass vial (Labco Exetainer), preserved with 20 μL of saturated HgCl₂. For the analysis of δ¹³C-DIC, a 2 mL helium headspace was created, and 100 μL of H₂PO₄ (99 %) was added into each vial to convert all DIC species into CO₂. After overnight equilibration, a variable volume of the headspace was injected into an EA coupled to an isotope ratio mass spectrometer (EA-IRMS; Thermo Scientific Flash HT with Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage). Calibration of δ¹³C-DIC measurements was performed with certified reference materials (LSVEC and either NBS-19 or IAEA-CO1) and the reproducibility of the measurement was always better than ±0.2 ‰.

Samples for particulate organic carbon (POC) concentrations and its stable C isotope signature (δ¹³C-POC) were filtered on pre-combusted (overnight at 450 °C) 25 mm glass
fiber filters (Advantec GF-75; 0.3 μm), and dried. These filters were later decarboxylated with HCl fumes for 4 h, dried, and packed in silver cups. POC and δ13C-POC were determined on an EA-IRMS (Thermo Scientific Flash HT with Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage). Calibration of POC and δ13C-POC was performed with IAEA-C6 and acetic acid, and reproducibility of δ13C-POC measurements, estimated based on triplicate measurements of standard, was typically better than 0.2‰.

Samples (~2 L) for measurements of phospholipid fatty acid concentrations (PLFAs) and their δ13C signature were filtered on pre-combusted 47 mm glass filters (Advantec GF-75; 0.3 μm), and kept frozen until further processing. Extraction and derivatization of PLFAs was performed following a modified Bligh and Dyer extraction, silica column partitioning, and mild alkali transmethylation as described by Boschker et al. (2004). Analyses were made on a Isolink GC-c-IRMS coupled to a Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage. All samples were analyzed in splitless mode, a Isolink GC-c-IRMS coupled to a Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage. Calibration of POC, the δ13C-POC, the δ13C-DIC and the δ13C-CH4 were performed as described above. Methanotrophic bacterial production (MBP, µmol L−1 d−1) rates were calculated according to Hama et al. (1983):

\[
MBP = POC_f \cdot \left( \frac{\%^{13}C-POC_f - \%^{13}C-POC_i}{t \cdot \left( \%^{13}C-CH_4 - \%^{13}C-POC_i \right)} \right) / \left( \%^{13}C-CH_4 - \%^{13}C-POC_i \right)
\]

where POC_f is the concentration of POC at the end of incubation (µmol L−1), %13C-POC_f and %13C-POC_i are the percentage of 13C in the POC and the end and the beginning of incubation, t is the incubation time (d−1) and %13C-CH4 is the percentage of 13C in CH4 directly after the inoculation of the bottles with the 13C tracer. The methanotrophic bacterial respiration rates (MBR, µmol L−1 d−1) were calculated according to

\[
MBR = DIC_f \cdot \left( \frac{\%^{13}C-DIC_f - \%^{13}C-DIC_i}{t \cdot \left( \%^{13}C-CH_4 - \%^{13}C-DIC_i \right)} \right) / \left( \%^{13}C-CH_4 - \%^{13}C-DIC_i \right)
\]

where DIC_f is the concentration of DIC after the incubation (µmol L−1), %13C-DIC_f and %13C-DIC_i are the final and initial percentage of 13C in DIC. Finally, the methanotrophic bacterial growth efficiency (MBGE, %) was calculated according to

\[
MBGE = \frac{MBP}{(MBP + MBR)} \cdot 100
\]

The CH4 concentration in the bottles sometimes increased drastically because of the 13C-CH4 addition, which could have induced a bias in the estimation of MBP and MBR in case of CH4-limitation of the methanotrophic bacteria community. However, performing incubation along a gradient of CH4 concentrations allowed us to assess if the measured MBP and MBR were positively related to the amount of tracer inoculated in the bottles. In case of such an effect (only at 50 m in the northern basin in February 2012 and at 60 m in the southern basin in September 2012) we applied a linear
regression model ($r^2$ always better than 0.90) to estimate the intercept with the y axis, which was assumed to correspond to the MBP or MBR rates at in situ CH$_4$ concentration.

### 2.5 Stable isotope probing of PLFAs (SIP-PLFAs) with $^{13}$C-CH$_4$

At each sampling depth and in parallel with the MBP measurement, four serum bottles (250 mL) were filled with water, overflowed and sealed with butyl stopper and aluminium caps. Bottles were spiked with 500 µL of $^{13}$C-CH$_4$ (99.9 %). After 24 h of incubation in the dark at lake temperature, the water from the four bottles was combined and filtered on a single pre-combusted 47 mm glass fiber filter (Advantec GF-75; 0.3 µm) to quantify the incorporation of the tracer in bacterial PLFAs. The filters were kept frozen until further processing. The extraction, derivatization and analysis by GC-c-IRMS were carried out as described above.

### 3 Results

#### 3.1 Physico-chemical parameters

In September 2012, the water column in the southern basin was oxic (> 3 µmol L$^{-1}$) from the surface to 65 m (Fig. 2a). CH$_4$ was abundant in deep waters, with a maximum concentration of 899 µmol L$^{-1}$ at 80 m; however, CH$_4$ decreased abruptly at the bottom of the oxycline, being 4 orders of magnitude lower in surface waters (Fig. 2a). Consistent with its biogenic origin, CH$_4$ was depleted in $^{13}$C in deep waters ($\delta^{13}$C-CH$_4$: −55.0‰) but became abruptly enriched in $^{13}$C at the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters, where CH$_4$ concentrations sharply decreased, to reach a maximal value of −39.0‰ at 62.5 m depth (Fig. 2a). The $\delta^{13}$C-POC values mirrored the pattern of $\delta^{13}$C-CH$_4$: they were almost constant from the surface to 55 m (−24.4 ± 0.3‰), then showed an abrupt excursion towards more negative values at the bottom of the oxycline, with a minimum value (−42.8‰) at 65 m depth (Fig. 2a). Similar results were found in September 2012 in the northern basin, where the water was oxic (> 3 µmol L$^{-1}$) down to 55 m (Fig. 2b). At the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters, an abrupt isotopic enrichment of the CH$_4$ was also observed and the $\delta^{13}$C-POC was relatively depleted in $^{13}$C, similarly as in the southern basin (Fig. 2b).

In February 2012 in the northern basin, the water was oxic (> 3 µmol L$^{-1}$) until 45 m depth, but the O$_2$ concentrations were below the limit of detection deeper in the water column (Fig. 2c). The gradual decrease in the CH$_4$ concentration between 60 and 45 m (from 110 to 3 µmol L$^{-1}$) was accompanied by a parallel increase of the $\delta^{13}$C-CH$_4$ signature in the same depth interval (from −55.9 to −41.7‰), the residual CH$_4$ becoming isotopically enriched as CH$_4$ concentration decreased (Fig. 2c). $\delta^{13}$C-POC values were also slightly lower below the oxic zone, with a minimum at 50 m (−26.9‰; Fig. 2c).

#### 3.2 Phospholipid fatty acid concentration and stable isotopic composition

Figure 3 show profiles of the relative concentration and the $\delta^{13}$C signature of specific PLFAs in September 2012 (Fig. 3a, b; southern basin) and February 2012 (Fig. 3c, d; northern basin). Irrespective of station, season and depth, the C16:0 saturated PLFAs was always the most abundant PLFAs (18–35 % of all PLFAs). The relative abundance of the C16 mono-unsaturated fatty acids (C16 MUFAs) significantly increased at the bottom of the oxycline in February and September 2012. The $\delta^{13}$C signature of the C16 MUFAs was comparable to the $\delta^{13}$C signature of the C16:0 in oxic waters, oscillating around −27 or −29‰ in February and September 2012, respectively. However, C16 MUFAs were largely depleted in $^{13}$C in the oxycline, with minimal $\delta^{13}$C values as low as −55.3‰ at the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters in September 2012, and −49.5‰ in February 2012. This very strong depletion in $\delta^{13}$C was only observed for this particular type of PLFAs (C16 MUFAs). The C18 MUFAs were slightly more abundant in oxic waters (on average 9 %) than in deeper waters (1–4 %). Their isotopic composition varied with depth following the same vertical pattern than C16 MUFAs, but with a lower amplitude. C18 MUFAs minima in $\delta^{13}$C were observed in O$_2$-depleted waters in February 2012 (55 m, −35.1‰) and September 2012 (70 m, −30.5‰). The relative abundance of iso- and anteiso-branched C15:0 PLFAs was systematically low (1–5 %) and did not follow any depth pattern. Their isotopic signature was however slightly lower in O$_2$-depleted waters than in oxic waters.

#### 3.3 Isotope fractionation factor determination

During the isotope fractionation factor experiment, a significant decrease of the CH$_4$ concentration over time and a parallel enrichment of the residual CH$_4$ (Fig. 4) were monitored in every bottle incubated under oxic conditions. However, no consumption of CH$_4$ was measured in O$_2$-depleted waters. The isotope fractionation factor measured at several depths across the oxycline ranged between 1.008 and 1.024, and averaged 1.016 ± 0.007 ($n = 5$).

#### 3.4 Methanotrophic bacterial production

MBP rates within the oxycline were variable (from 0 to 7.0 µmol C L$^{-1}$ d$^{-1}$). Maximum values were always observed at the bottom of the oxycline, near the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters (Fig. 2d, e, f); however substantial MBP (up to 2.2 µmol L$^{-1}$ d$^{-1}$) were also recorded in O$_2$-depleted waters in February 2012 (Fig. 2f). Vertically integrated over the water column, MBP rates were estimated at 28.6 and 8.2 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ in September...
contrast, the specific incorporation pattern was dominated by C17 MUFA, and to a lesser extent 10Me16:0 and C16 MUFA in O2-depleted waters in February 2012 (Fig. 5b).

4 Discussion

The sharp decrease of CH4 concentration and the isotopic enrichment of the residual CH4 in the oxycline, mirrored by the isotopic depletion of the POC pool at these depths indicated that microbial CH4 oxidation is a strong CH4 sink within the water column of Lake Kivu. Similar patterns characterized by a strong isotopic depletion of the POC pool in the oxycline were reported in other systems, such as the meromictic northern basin of Lake Lugano (Lehmann et al., 2004; Blees et al., 2014). The fraction of the upward CH4 flux oxidized within a depth interval can be estimated from a closed-system Rayleigh model of isotope fractionation (Blees et al., 2014).
Figure 3. Vertical profiles of the relative abundance of phospholipid fatty acids (PLFAs, %) and their respective carbon isotopic signature ($\delta^{13}$C-PLFAs, ‰) in (a, b) the southern basin in September 2012 (dry season) and (c, d) in the northern basin in February 2012. Error bars representing standard deviation of replicates were smaller than the data point size. The grey zone corresponds to waters with dissolved $O_2$ concentration < 3 µmol L$^{-1}$.

Figure 4. Example (62.5 m) of relationship between the $\delta^{13}$C-$CH_4$ and the fraction of $CH_4$ remaining in the bottles during the incubation (%) to determine the isotope fractionation factor carried out in September 2012 in the southern basin. Data points were gathered at a 24 h interval. Symbols are the mean of duplicates; error bars represent standard deviation of duplicates when higher than data point size.

The relatively wide range of the estimated percentage of $CH_4$ oxidation processes in preventing $CH_4$ to reach the surface waters of the lake.

The theoretical $\delta^{13}$C signature of methanotrophs can be estimated at each depth from $\delta^{13}$C-$CH_4$ values and the experimental isotope fractionation factor ($\alpha$, ranged between 1.009–1023). Applying a simple isotope mixing model with the $\delta^{13}$C signature of methanotrophs as an end-member and the $\delta^{13}$C-POC in the surface (5 m) as an organic matter end-member which forms as sediment, it is possible to estimate the contribution of $CH_4$-derived C to the POC pool. Indeed, the contribution of $CH_4$-derived C appeared to be substantial at the bottom of the mixolimnion. In September 2012 in the southern basin, 32–44% of the depth-integrated POC pool in the oxycline (between 60 and 70 m) originated from $CH_4$ incorporation, with a local maximum at the transition between oxic and $O_2$-depleted waters. Hence, $CH_4$ oxidation in Lake Kivu seems to be mainly driven by oxic processes. Furthermore, maximal MBP rates were observed where the in situ $CH_4$ : $O_2$ ratio ranged between 0.1 and 10 (molar units, Fig. 6), encompassing the stoichiometric $CH_4$ : $O_2$ ratio for aerobic microbial $CH_4$ oxidation (0.5) and
the optimal ratio estimated in the culture experiments (0.9, Amaral and Knowles, 1995). This relationship highlights the importance of the regulation of aerobic methanotrophic production by both CH$_4$ and O$_2$ availability. Vertically integrated over the water column, the MBP was estimated at 29.5 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ during the rainy season in the northern basin, and 28.6 and 8.2 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ during the dry season in the southern basin and the northern basin, respectively. These rates are comparable to the gross CH$_4$ oxidation rate reported earlier by Jannasch (1975) in Lake Kivu (7.2 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) and the upward CH$_4$ flux recently estimated (9.38 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$) by Pasche et al. (2009). Areal MBP in Lake Kivu is equivalent to 16–60 % of the mean annual phytoplankton primary production (49 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, Durachmbeau et al., 2014), suggesting that biomass production by methanotrophs has the potential to sustain a significant fraction of the pelagic food web. For example, it has been shown that cyclopoid copepods (mesozooplankton) of Lake Kivu escape visual predators by migrating below the euphotic zone, sometimes down to O$_2$-depleted waters (Isumbisho et al., 2006), where they might feed on CH$_4$-derived C sources.  

The relative contribution of MBP to the autochtonous production in Lake Kivu was distinctly higher than those reported in three Swedish lakes during summer, where MBP was equivalent to 0.3 and 7.0 % of the phytoplankton production (Bastviken et al., 2003). This was unrelated to the phytoplankton production rates in the Swedish lakes that ranged between 7 and 83 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ and encompassed the average phytoplankton production value in Lake Kivu (49 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$). The MBP rates in the Swedish lakes (based on $^{14}$C incuations) were, however, distinctly lower than in Lake Kivu, ranging between 0.3 and 1.8 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$. This difference is probably related to the high CH$_4$ concentrations at the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters in Lake Kivu, as MBP peaked in the Swedish lakes at CH$_4$ concentrations <100 mmol L$^{-1}$, while MBP peaked in Lake Kivu at CH$_4$ concentrations one to two orders of magnitude higher. Kankaala et al. (2013) reported seasonally resolved (for the ice-free period) MBP in five small (0.004 to 13.4 km$^2$) boreal humic lakes (with dissolved organic C concentrations ranging between 7 and 24 mg C L$^{-1}$) in southern Finland. In these lakes, phytoplankton production and MBP were highly variable, ranging...
between 5 and 50 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ and < 0.2 mmol C m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$ and 41 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, respectively. MBP was significantly higher in the two smallest lakes (0.004–0.008 km$^2$), characterized by high CH$_4$ concentrations (< 750 µmol L$^{-1}$) and permanent anoxia throughout the year in bottom waters. Considering a MBGE of 25%, their MBP estimates corresponded to a highly variable percentage of phytoplankton production, between 35 and 100% in the two smallest lakes, and between 0.4 and 5.0% in the three larger lakes (0.04 to 13.4 km$^2$), and therefore they proposed that the relative contribution of methanotrophic bacteria to the total autotrophic production in a lake is related to its size (Kankaala et al., 2013). However, the results reported for the large (2370 km$^2$) Lake Kivu do not fit with this general pattern, probably because of the permanent and strong stratification of its water column that on one hand promotes a long residence time of deep waters and the accumulation of CH$_4$, and on the other hand leads to very slow upward diffusion of solutes, promoting the removal of CH$_4$ by bacterial oxidation as it diffuses to the surface.

The MBGE found during this study was variable (2–50%), but within the range of reported values in fresh waters (15–80%, King, 1992; 6–72%, Bastviken et al., 2003). MBGE was negatively related to the CH$_4$ : O$_2$ ratio (Fig. 7); i.e. a smaller fraction of the oxidized CH$_4$ was incorporated into the biomass at the bottom of the oxycline, where O$_2$ availability was relatively limited compared to CH$_4$. It has been recently suggested that under O$_2$-limiting conditions, methanotrophic bacteria are able to generate energy (adenosine triphosphate) by fermentation of formaldehyde (Kaluzhnaya et al., 2013), the key intermediate in the oxidation of CH$_4$. This CH$_4$-based fermentation pathway would lead to the production of excreted organic acids (lactate, formate, ...) from CH$_4$-derived C instead of converting CH$_4$ into cellular biomass. If the metabolic abilities for this process are ubiquitous in methanotrophic organisms, it may potentially occur within the water column of Lake Kivu, at the bottom of the oxycline or in micro-oxic zones, as suggested by the low MBGE values found at high CH$_4$ : O$_2$ molar ratio.

Almost all known aerobic methanotrophic bacteria are phylogenetically affiliated to Proteobacteria, belonging either to the Gammaproteobacteria (also referred to type I methanotrophs) or Alphaproteobacteria (type II methanotrophs) classes (Hanson and Hanson, 1996). The two distinct groups differ in some important physiological characteristics. Notably, they use different C fixation pathway (ribulose monophosphate for type I; the serine pathway for type II) and possess different patterns of PLFAs. C16 MUFA are especially abundant in the type I methanotrophs while the type II methanotrophs contain mainly C18 MUFA (Le Bodelier et al., 2009). Therefore, the much larger $^{13}$C depletion of C16 MUFA than C18 MUFA and the strong labelling of C16 MUFA during the incubation with $^{13}$C-CH$_4$ indicate that the aerobic methanotrophic community was dominated by type I methanotrophs in the water column during this study. In contrast, Type II methanotrophs did not appear to contribute much to the overall CH$_4$ oxidation in Lake Kivu, in good agreement with the results of Pasche et al. (2011). Nevertheless, in February 2012 the C16 MUFA appeared to be strongly depleted in $^{13}$C below the transition between oxic and O$_2$-depleted waters (Fig. 3). Strong $^{13}$C-depletion of bacterial lipid markers for aerobic methanotrophic bacteria in O$_2$-depleted waters has also been reported in the Black Sea (Schubert et al., 2006) and in Lake Lugano (Blees et al., 2014). The presence of methanotrophic bacterial biomass below the oxycline could simply result from gravity-driven physical particle transport from oxic waters, but it has been also demonstrated that some aerobic methanotrophs are able to persist under low oxygen conditions in a reversible state of reduced metabolic activity (Roslev and King, 1995). In contrast, the recovery of these aerobic methanotrophs after CH$_4$ deprivation under oxic conditions is less successful because of a significant degradation of cell proteins (Roslev and King, 1995). Blees et al. (2014) suggested that this physiological preference for O$_2$ starvation than CH$_4$ starvation under oxic conditions would drive aerobic methanotrophs towards the O$_2$-depleted part of the oxygen continuum. This concept seems particularly important in tropical lakes because the thermal stratification of the water column is usually very dynamic in these systems due to the small temperature gradient, allowing episodic, yet frequent, O$_2$ intrusion events into deeper waters. Aerobic methanotrophs in dormancy would recover quickly after the episodical O$_2$ injection, and resume rapidly micro aerobic CH$_4$ oxidation (Blees et al., 2014).

The dominance of type I over type II methanotrophs has been frequently reported in various stratified freshwater (Sundh et al., 2005; Blees et al., 2014) or marine envi-

![Figure 7](https://example.com/f7.png)

**Figure 7.** In Lake Kivu, relationship between the methanotrophic bacterial growth efficiency and the in situ CH$_4$ : O$_2$ molar ratio. Symbols represent mean MBGE values, vertical error bars represent standard deviation of replicates. The CH$_4$ : O$_2$ ratio was calculated with an O$_2$ concentration value of 3 µmol L$^{-1}$ when observed in situ values were below the detection limit of the sensor (3 µmol L$^{-1}$).
environments (Schubert et al., 2006; Schmale et al., 2012), but this recurrent observation is still difficult to explain. In a recent review, Ho et al. (2013) attempted to classify several genera of methanotrophs according to their life strategies, using the competitor/stress-tolerator/ruderal functional classification framework (Grime, 1977). Since type I methanotrophs dominate the active community in many environments and are known to respond rapidly to substrate availability, they classified them as competitors, or competitor ruderals. In contrast, they proposed that type II members would be more tolerant to environmental stress, and thus classified them as stress tolerators, or stress-tolerator ruderals. Relatively large availability of CH$_4$ and O$_2$ (O$_2$:CH$_4$ ratio close to 1, Figs. 2 and 6) at the bottom of the oxycline of Lake Kivu is a favourable environment for the competitor-ruderal bacterial communities that could explain the dominance of type I methanotrophs over type II methanotrophs in this lake.

A significant MBP rate (1.3 μmol L$^{-1}$ d$^{-1}$) was measured in O$_2$-depleted waters (<3 μmol L$^{-1}$) at 60 m during the rainy season (February 2012). Moreover, the PLFA labelling pattern was drastically different, with a more important specific $^{13}$C incorporation into 10Me16:0 and C17 MUFA instead of the C16 MUFA, relative to their concentrations. This different labelling pattern suggests that a different population of methanotrophs was active in CH$_4$ oxidation deeper in the water column. Archaea lack ester-linked fatty acids in their membrane and are therefore undetectable in PLFA analysis. However 10Me16:0 and C17 MUFA are known to be especially abundant in sulphate-reducing bacteria (Macalady et al., 2000; Boschker and Middelburg, 2002), one of the syntrophic partner of anaerobic CH$_4$ oxidizing archaea (Knittel and Boetius, 2009). Hence, the specific labelling pattern of the anaerobic CH$_4$-depleted waters could indicate that a fraction of the upward flux of CH$_4$ was oxidized syntrophically by an archaea/bacteria consortium, and might support the hypothesis that the bacterial partner grow on CH$_4$-derived carbon source supplied by anaerobic methane oxidizers within the consortium, as already suggested by the results of an in vitro labelling ($^{13}$CH$_4$) study (Blumenberg et al., 2005). However, our data does not necessarily imply that anaerobic methane oxidation would be coupled with SO$_4^{2-}$ reduction, as some sulphate-reducing bacteria have also been found to be able to reduce iron (Coleman et al., 1993). Furthermore, the phylogenetic resolution of SIP-PLFA analyses in rather low (Uhlkk et al., 2009), and recent studies showed that anaerobic methane oxidation could be carried out syntrophically by consortium between methanotrophic archaea and denitrifying bacteria (Raghoebarsing et al., 2006), or between methanotrophic archaea and manganese reducing bacteria (Beal et al., 2009). Further investigations would be needed to address more accurately which is the electron acceptors coupled to anaerobic CH$_4$ oxidation.

5 Conclusions

We provide conclusive evidences on the occurrence of CH$_4$ oxidation in the oxycline of Lake Kivu using stable isotope characterization of a suite of carbon pools (CH$_4$, POC, PLFAs) as well as rate measurements (MBP). Vertically integrated MBP ranged between 8 and 29 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, and was higher than previously reported in other lakes (Bastvinken et al., 2003; Kankaala et al., 2013). MBP was equivalent to 16–60 % of the average annual phytoplankton primary production, a fraction distinctly higher than previously reported in other lakes, usually < 10 % (Bastvinken et al., 2003; Kankaala et al., 2006). Hence, methanotrophic bacteria could potentially sustain a significant fraction of the pelagic food web in this oligotrophic CH$_4$-rich lake. Lake Kivu ranks globally among the lakes with the lowest CH$_4$ emissions into the atmosphere (Borges et al., 2011), despite the huge amount of CH$_4$ dissolved in its deep waters and a relatively high upward flux of CH$_4$ to the mixed layer (9.38 mmol m$^{-2}$ d$^{-1}$, Pasche et al., 2009). This apparent paradox is linked to its strong meromictic nature that on one hand promotes a long residence time of deep waters and the accumulation of CH$_4$, and on the other hand leads to very slow upward diffusion of solutes, promoting the removal of CH$_4$ by microbial oxidation as it diffuses to the surface.

Acknowledgements. We are grateful to Boniface Kaningini, Pascal Isimbisho and Pascal Masiliya (Institut Supérieur Pédagogique, Bukavu, DRC), Laetitia Ninyamwima (National University of Rwanda, Rwanda), for logistic support during the cruises, to Laetitia Montante and to Stephan Hoornmaert for helping during fieldwork and during laboratory analysis, and to Christophe Rabouille (associate editor), Martin Schmid, and two anonymous reviewers for providing constructive comments on an earlier version of this manuscript. This work was funded by the EAGLES (East African great lake ecosystem sensitivity to changes, SD/AR/02A) project from the Belgian Federal Science Policy Office (BELSPO, Belgium), the CABI (Cycle du carbone et des nutriments au Lac Kivu, contract 2.4.598.07) and MICKI (Microbial diversity and processes in Lake Kivu, contract 2.4.515.11) projects from the Fonds National de la Recherche Scientifique (FNRS, Belgium), and contributes to the European Research Council (ERC) starting grant project AFRIVAL (African river basins: catchment-scale carbon fluxes and transformations, 240002). A.V. Borges is a senior research associate at the FNRS.

Edited by: C. Rabouille

References


Hanson, R. S. and Hanson, T. E.: Methanotrophic bacteria, Microbiol. Rev., 60, 439–471, 1996.


2088 C. Morana et al.: Methanotrophy within the water column of a large tropical lake


